



Staff Report for Budget Committee of the Whole Meeting

Date of Meeting: November 12, 2019

Report Number: SRCS.19.20

Department: Community Services
Division: Recreation and Culture Services

Subject: **SRCS.19.20 - Options for the Implementation of an Indoor Bocce Facility**

Purpose:

The purpose of this report is to provide Council with options for the implementation of an indoor bocce facility as per the Members Motion of Council at its meeting of February 25, 2019.

Recommendation(s):

- a) That Staff Report SRCS.19.20, Options for the Implementation of an Indoor Bocce Facility be received.

Contact Person:

Darlene Joslin, Director, Recreation and Culture, Extension 2423

Nick Kalyvas, Director, Facility Design, Construction & Maintenance, Extension 2522

Report Approval:

Submitted by: Ilmar Simanovskis, Commissioner of Community Services

Approved by: Neil Garbe, City Manager

All reports are electronically reviewed and/or approved by the Division Director, Treasurer (as required), City Solicitor (as required), Commissioner and City Manager. Details of the reports approval are attached.

Page 2

Background:

The City operated a year round, indoor, 4 court bocce facility at the Rouge Woods Community Centre from 2001 to 2017. In 2013, the recreation plan was adopted by Council that provided guidance for future recreation planning and operational needs. An analysis of indoor bocce facility utilization determined that there was a declining participation with a number of courts not being utilized during prime time and nearly all courts not being utilized during non-prime time. Membership numbers had declined 60% to 54 members and the City was subsidizing this level of service 84%. Based on these trends, it was recommended that the bocce facilities within Rouge Woods Community Centre be removed and the space repurposed. Future bocce needs would then be met through outdoor bocce facilities.

At the April 4, 2016 Committee of the Whole meeting, staff were directed to undertake a study to repurpose the indoor bocce facility at Rouge Woods Community Centre into a multi-purpose gymnasium as recommended in the approved Recreation Plan. As part of that study, staff were directed to provide options for alternative indoor space to accommodate a portable bocce playing surface.

A number of options for indoor bocce courts were tested. After numerous locations and configurations, an indoor seasonal option was offered at the Agricultural building at Richmond Green at a total capital cost of \$36,000. The three temporary courts located within the agricultural building provide indoor play opportunities during the winter season when outdoor play is not possible. A further enhancement was implemented in early November of 2019 to add a turf surface to the courts to reduce the generation of dust from the sand base. This enhancement was approved by Council with a budget of \$26,000.

At its meeting of February 24, 2019, Council adopted the following members motion.

Whereas the indoor bocce court at Rouge Woods Community Centre was decommissioned in 2018;

Whereas there still exists a large demand among Richmond Hill residents for an indoor bocce facility;

Therefore be it resolved that the Commissioner of Community Services be directed to bring forward a staff report with options to implement an indoor bocce facility.

This staff report provides options for Council consideration for an indoor bocce facility.

Page 3

Financial/Staffing/Other Implications:

Current Services- Three temporary bocce courts at the Richmond Green Agriculture Building

Staff implemented a portable bocce facility with three courts and a lounge/kitchenette area at the Richmond Green Agriculture Building. These portable courts are made available October through April and due to the setup requirements no other public use activities can take place during the season. The first season with this facility was 2018/2019. Although the courts are in place seven days per week and available from 9:00 a.m. – 11:00 p.m., the members typically play during prime time hours as follows;

Members predominantly from the Richmond Hill Social & Bocce Club utilized the facility Monday and Wednesday evenings 7:00 – 11:00 p.m. (Approximately 36 participants). There was also a Special Olympics group that had 22 members and utilized Saturday mornings 10:00 – 11:30 a.m.

Although meeting the mandate of Council for temporary indoor bocce facilities, the bocce participants had identified the following concerns with this solution:

- There is only three courts where they believe four courts are required
- The facility is not well suited to providing adequate space and amenities for the membership
- The crushed gravel base can create dust even after dampened with water before game play

Attached are photos of the current configuration.

Identification of Bocce Facility Needs

Determining the community needs for services such as bocce is typically identified through a needs assessment process. The most recent needs analysis adopted by Council is the 2013 Recreation Plan that led to the decommissioning of the courts at Rouge Woods Community Centre.

In the absence of a community wide evaluation of the demand for bocce courts, staff are responding to the existing bocce participants comments and expectations for bocce facilities. Based on discussions with the membership and Councillor representatives, it is expected that four courts are to be provided and that the playing surface be similar to what was provided at the Rouge Woods indoor facility.

Facility Options

Four options were identified to respond to the request of Council in providing indoor bocce facilities. Those options are to:

- 1) Maintain the status quo
- 2) Provide an improved bocce playing surface

Page 4

- 3) Modify the existing building to accommodate an additional court and improved playing conditions
- 4) Construct a new bocce facility

A.W. Hooker, a costing consultant, was retained to provide class “D” estimates for each option. Each option and their associated risks, benefits, costs and schedule are outlined below. The accuracy of all estimates are limited by the information available at the time of this report. These estimates will be refined at the time that design is completed when all project requirements have been defined and finalized. All construction costs assume summer construction and regular working hours.

Option 1 - Maintain the Status Quo

The current arrangement consists of three removable bocce courts installed at Richmond Green Agriculture Building that are dismantled in the spring and are re-installed in the fall. The lane dividers consist of wood boards and steel fencing. Existing amenities includes a kitchenette, seating areas for socialization and washroom facilities. This option would have no additional capital cost requirement.

Option 2 - Install Specialized Bocce Court Flooring at Richmond Green Agriculture Building

This option considers the reconstruction of the facility floor to provide a level playing surface and the application of a specially bocce flooring material (similar to the surface used at Rouge Woods Community Centre) to the entire floor of the Agriculture Building, while utilizing the existing three removable bocce court setup. Facility multiuse utilization would be maintained by continuing to use the removable court barriers and dividers. The facility footprint would not be increased under this option and the existing facility amenities, as noted in Option 1, would be maintained and unchanged.

Start dates for major project milestones would be as follows:

- Engineering & Design: Q1 2020
- Procurement: Q4 2020
- Start of Construction: Q2 2021

Renovating the Agriculture Building will require four to six months of construction time during which the Agriculture Building will not be available for use by any user groups or City run programs.

This option improves the playing experience for the bocce user group while also maintaining the building’s flexibility for other purposes. It does not provide an additional bocce court lane nor does it increase the clear ceiling height (as was provided originally at Rouge Woods Community Centre). The building would also not be updated to meet current building code requirements for improved accessibility.

Page 5

The estimated total capital cost to renovate the Agriculture Building, including design and construction, is approximately \$543,000.

Option 3 - Modify the Existing Richmond Green Agriculture Building to Install Four Permanent Bocce Courts and Improved Amenities

This option proposes to expand the existing Agricultural Building to accommodate an additional court, for a total of four bocce courts.

This proposed option includes the installation of permanent courts sunken into the floor. Facility multiuse utilization for spring/summer programming would be maintained by the use of a removable flooring system that would be installed to cover the sunken playing area of the courts. The clearance between the bocce playing surface and the ceiling would meet play standards and specialized bocce flooring materials would be applied to the court play surface.

Start dates for major project milestones would be as follows:

- Feasibility Study: Q1 2020
- Engineering & Design: Q3 2020
- Procurement: Q2 2021
- Start of Construction: Q1 2022

Reconstruction of the Agriculture Building will require ten to twelve months of construction time during which the Agriculture Building will not be available for use by any user groups or City run programs.

This option addresses all requested bocce facility improvements (height, number of courts, improved playing surface, and improved amenities). It also provides an opportunity to update the facility to both modernize it and make it fully accessible. There are however a number of significant risks with this option.

A comparable removable floor system, that meets the City's requirements, could not be benchmarked to date. Therefore, a custom removable flooring system will need to be engineered as part of the detailed design. Due to the unknown feasibility of designing a removable flooring solution, the estimated cost impacts for this option reflects this uncertainty. The cost implications of the false floor system, on both design and construction, cannot be fully quantified at this time and will be understood during the feasibility and design stage.

There are also risks associated with retrofitting the existing facility, as significant architectural, mechanical, electrical and structural modifications would be required. Replacement or repair of these building components will need to be undertaken during this project and therefore contribute to the overall cost of this option.

The existing building is approximately 540 m² and the estimated space required for a four court bocce facility, with the necessary support services, is approximately 1020 m².

Page 6

Therefore, a facility expansion of approximately 480 m² would be required. Due to the life-cycle condition of the facility, the existing area would undergo a major renovation as previously stated along with the construction of the new expansion. The estimated total capital cost to modify the Agriculture Building, including design and construction, is approximately \$4.8 million.

It should be noted that this option does not align with the City of Richmond Hill's Recreation Master Plan in that this additional space would be of better service to the community if incorporated with another existing recreation facility to both increase service flexibility and take advantage of access and efficiency of other existing facility amenities.

Option 4 - New Permanent Bocce Facility Complete with Convertible Courts and Amenities

An option for a new facility has also been considered as part of this report. A new facility comes with fewer project risks (when compared to Option 3) and has the added benefit of locating the facility in an area of the City that aligns with the Recreation Master Plan.

For the purposes of this report, the new facility is assumed to be identical in size to the facility described in Option 3 and would feature the same removable false floor, bocce specific flooring material, four courts meeting bocce play standards, and accessibility improvements. This option also provides the most flexibility with respect to location. The new facility could be constructed as a standalone building or as an expansion to an existing community centre.

In the scenario of constructing an expansion to an existing community centre, the design would be done in a way to allow for the area to be converted into a multi-purpose space in future if programming needs change. There is a request in the 2020 capital budget for a Recreational Master Plan update which would be the appropriate mechanism for the location and needs assessment evaluation.

The choice of location for the facility must still be determined through the City's internal processes and consultations. The preferred location may also trigger additional studies and assessments (environmental, traffic, site plan approval, etc.).

Start dates for major project milestones would be as follows:

- Use and Needs Analysis: Q1 2020
- Feasibility Study: Q3 2021
- Engineering & Design: Q2 2022
- Procurement: Q2 2023
- Start of Construction: Q1 2024

The duration of constructing a new facility is approximately eighteen to twenty-four months during which the Agriculture Building will still be available for use. The estimated capital cost to construction of a new facility is approximately \$7.2 million. It should be

Page 7

noted that this option assumes the facility will be constructed on existing City property and the cost for acquisition of a new property is not included.

This option does align with the City of Richmond Hill Recreation Master Plan in that future space is considered in a broader needs basis and incorporated with other facilities to maximize potential for use and access to multiple user groups.

Page 8

Options Comparison

The pros and cons of the available options are summarized in the table below.

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4
Description	Maintain status quo	Install Specialized Bocce Court Flooring at Richmond Green Agriculture Building	Modify the Existing Richmond Green Agriculture Building to Install Four Permanent Bocce Courts and Improved Amenities	New Permanent Bocce Facility Complete with Convertible Courts and Amenities
Estimated Capital Cost	No cost	\$543,000	\$4,770,000	\$7,140,000
Estimated Construction Time	–	4 - 6 months	10 - 12 months	18 - 24 months
Pros	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No capital spending required - No programming disruption - Removable courts to keep multi-function use of building 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Premium bocce playing surface - Removable courts to keep multi-function use of building 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All lanes meet official bocce court standards - Provides a fourth bocce court - Premium bocce playing surface - Removable courts to keep multi-function use of building - Improved accessibility for users - Updated to current building code requirements - Improved amenities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All lanes meet official bocce court standards - Provides a fourth bocce court - Premium bocce playing surface - Removable courts to keep multi-function use of building - Aligns with the City's Recreation Master Plan - Can be renovated as a multipurpose facility in the future - Improved accessibility for users - Updated to current building code requirements

Page 9

				- Improved amenities
Cons	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No fourth bocce lane - Does not meet all requirements of official bocce court standards - Lack of premium playing surface - No improved amenities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased operating costs to maintain flooring - Does not meet all requirements of official bocce court standards - No fourth bocce lane - Programming disruption during construction - No opportunity to update facility to current code requirements - No improved amenities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased operating costs to maintain flooring - Requirement for additional staff as removal and installation will need more than one staff person - Large storage requirements for false floor - Extended programming disruption during construction - Does not align with the City's Recreation Master Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased operating costs to maintain flooring - Requirement for additional staff as removal and installation will need more than one staff person - Large storage requirements for false floor - Potential programming disruption during construction

Next Steps

The following summarizes the next steps to be taken for each option depending on Council's direction. It should be re-stated that the information and recommendations provided above are based on what is currently known regarding each option. Project scope, costs and schedules are estimates and will be refined as the project requirements are further defined. However, in order to proceed further the following next steps are required and staff are seeking direction.

Option 1 - Maintain the Status Quo

This option does not require any further action as the courts are in place.

Option 2 - Install Specialized Bocce Court Flooring at Richmond Green Agriculture Building

In order to proceed with this option, the next step would be to retain a consultant to complete the design. Consulting fees for this option is \$60,000.

Page 10

Option 3 - Modify the Existing Richmond Green Agriculture Building to Install Four Permanent Bocce Courts and Improved Amenities

In order to proceed with this option, the next step would be to retain a consultant to undertake a feasibility study to assess the practicality of the option prior to undertaking design. Consulting fees for this option is \$80,000.

Option 4- New Permanent Bocce Facility Complete with Convertible Courts and Amenities

In order to proceed with this option, the next step would be to undertake an assessment of the site selection and space needs as part of a Recreation Master Plan update, which is part of the 2020 capital projects proposals being considered by Council. Once a preferable site and program space priorities are recommended, a feasibility study would follow at which point the City would be to retain a consultant to undertake a feasibility study to assess the practicality of the option prior to undertaking design. Consulting fees for this option is \$130,000. Cost for the recreation master plan update are included in the 2020 capital program proposal to Council.

Relationship to the Strategic Plan:

The provision of recreation facilities and programs supports the strategic goal of creating better options for being active and involved. The specific action is to develop and promote a range of organized and informal sports, recreation and cultural programs with an emphasis on alternatives that people will use throughout their lives.

Conclusion:

At its meeting of February 24, 2019, Council directed staff to bring forward a staff report with options to implement an indoor bocce facility. This report has identified three options in addition to the current temporary facility provisions at Richmond Green agriculture building. In order to proceed staff are seeking direction from council on which option to proceed with.

Attachments:

The following attached documents may include scanned images of appendixes, maps and photographs. If you require an alternative format please call the contact person listed in this document.

- Photos (existing temporary bocce at Richmond Green Agricultural Building)

Page 11

Report Approval Details

Document Title:	SRCS.19.20 Options for the Implementation of an Indoor Bocce Facility.docx
Attachments:	- SRCS.19.20 Attachment 1.pdf
Final Approval Date:	Nov 5, 2019

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:

Ilmar Simanovskis - Nov 5, 2019 - 1:33 PM

Task assigned to Neil Garbe was completed by delegate Italo Brutto

Italo Brutto on behalf of Neil Garbe - Nov 5, 2019 - 1:57 PM