## CULTURAL HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT

11575 Yonge Street Richmond Hill, Ontario

25 November 2019

prepared by



architecture + planning + urban design + heritage conservation +

real estate development

21 Scollard St., #103 Toronto, ON M5R 1G1 CANADA 416.920.8105 mark@mwhallcorp.com www.mwhallcorp.com

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

#### 1.0 BACKGROUND

- 1.1 Why Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment [CHIA] was undertaken
- 1.2 Owner and Consultant Team for the CHIA
- 1.3 Date of the Evaluation
- 1.4 Methodology used to prepare the assessment
- 2.0 INTRODUCTION TO THE SUBJECT PROPERTY
  - 2.1 Description of the property/significant features of buildings, landscapes, vistas
  - 2.2 Heritage resources within the subject property, landscapes, buildings
  - 2.3 Context, including adjacent properties, land uses, etc.
  - 2.4 History of the site uses
  - 2.5 History of the property, Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Resources
  - 2.6 Physical condition, security and critical maintenance concerns of property

#### 3.0 EVALUATION OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST

- 3.1 Heritage Resources within the subject property, landscapes
- 3.2 History of the property
- 3.3 Historical landowners of the property
- 3.4 Cultural Heritage Value or Interest of the subject property
- 3.5 Summary evaluation of the property
- 4.0 DESCRIPTION AND EXAMINATION OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT/SITE ALTERATIONS
  - 4.1 Description of the proposed development or site alteration in relation to the heritage resource.
- 4.2 How the proposed development / site alteration will impact the heritage resources
- 5.0 MITIGATION OPTIONS, CONSERVATION METHODS AND PROPOSED ALTERNATIVES
  - 5.1 Mitigation measures, conservation methods, and/or alternative development options that avoid or limit the direct and indirect impacts to the heritage resource.

#### REFERENCES

APPENDIX

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

11575 Yonge Street is a generally rectangular parcel of land, 50m wide x 25m deep, on the east side of Yonge Street north of the historic core of Richmond Hill. This is an area of the town which is undergoing redevelopment including residential and commercial uses and widening improvements of Yonge Street. In the center of the property is a single storey Designated Heritage building, a 19<sup>th</sup> century schoolhouse with adjacent paved parking which is presently being used as retail/commercial offices for a sign making business. North of the property is a new eight storey residential apartment building with ground floor commercial development. East and south of the property is a newer townhouse development. West of Yonge Street in this area, directly across Yonge Street is a new private school, a vacant parcel, a car dealership and an older drive-in motel.

#### 1.0 BACKGROUND

#### 1.1 Why Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment [CHIA] was undertaken

Owner of the property is considering clearance of the property, including removal of the Designated heritage building, likely for replacement development of new medium density housing on this parcel. Clearly this area of Richmond Hill is undergoing significant change. The owner has investigated commercial or residential reuse of the property, with or without retention of the designated heritage building.

#### **1.2** Present owner of 11575 Yonge street is:

Mr. Rachid Kistofilis SKN Development INC. 11575 Yonge Street Richmond Hill Telephone: (416) 886 7654

The owners of the property commissioned MW HALL CORPORATION to prepare this Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment.

#### **1.3** This CHIA was conducted beginning 9 October 2019.

#### **1.4** Methodology used to prepare this assessment included:

- a. determine heritage status of the property with Town of Richmond Hill register of heritage properties
- b. internet research related to the property
- c. conduct of a site visit to review the property
- d. working with the owner regarding plans for redevelopment of property.

#### 2.0 INTRODUCTION TO THE SUBJECT SITE

This Assessment has been prepared in accord with Town of Richmond Hill Terms of Reference for Heritage Impact Assessments relative to potential adaptive reuse of property.

#### 2.1 Description of the property, significant features, buildings, landscape and vistas.

The subject property includes of a mid-nineteenth century one-room brick schoolhouse building which is presently operating as a commercial use on the east side of Yonge Street in Richmond Hill. The building is roughly in the centre of the site, with vacant paved areas. Yonge Street in this area is in the process of widening and upgrading with a slope upwards from south to north. There is a single drive entrance/exit at the north end of the site onto Yonge Street in this area to the property. The building has only electricity service, no water, sanitary sewer or storm sewer. At the northern edge of the property is a utility vault, constructed as part of the multi-storey residential building there which contains future connections for water and sewer.

#### 2.2 Description of the cultural heritage resources.

The single storey building on the property is a brick bearing wall structure with pitched roof and original brick, now non-functional chimney. The building has a single entry/exit door facing Yonge Street, with windows on the north, south and west sides. There no heating system other than electric heating. The building is a Designated Heritage structure under the Ontario Heritage Act identified as "Jefferson Schoolhouse". Jefferson Side Road, an east-west thoroughfare north of the property is a major roadway in Richmond. An historic hamlet called Jefferson as established along Yonge street in the 19<sup>th</sup> century north of the property. This small service area is named for Jonathon Jefferson who settled in the area establishing a store and a post office. The designated Jefferson Schoolhouse was constructed circa 1840. The address is 11575, located on the west side of Yonge Street south of Jefferson Side Road. The Jefferson House/Post Office constructed circa 1890, is a Designated Heritage building located off the highway at 11666 Yonge Street, north of the schoolhouse on the west side of Yonge Street. Both designated heritage properties are, today, surrounded by contemporary 20<sup>th</sup> century commercial and residential development. Yonge Street has become a major thoroughfare. The earlier character of these heritage buildings which were at that time surrounded by relatively undeveloped farmlands has been totally transformed such that these buildings are perceived as insignificant to Richmond Hill today.

## 2.3 Description of the surrounding context including adjacent heritage properties, landscapes, any undesignated cultural heritage resources.

Jefferson Schoolhouse is a small, deteriorated building surrounded by much larger new residential and commercial development with a widened, higher speed multi-lane Yonge Street thoroughfare at its front entry. Properties on east and west sides of Yonge Street in this area are modern, mixed use, including multi-story structures, auto dealerships, school, motel and some vacant lands. Richmond Hill Official Plan identifies this property to be 'Regional Mixed-Use Area'.

#### 2.4 History of the site uses

This schoolhouse site was apparently a single isolated use in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, and likely selected along Yonge Street as a convenient location for local farm families. There are no other heritage structures in the vicinity of this site.

#### 2.5 History of the property

Originally an important building in the rural setting of 19<sup>th</sup> century Ontario, along the most important Yonge Street roadway at the Jefferson post office and store, today this center no longer exists or is of notice by residents in this area. The remnant schoolhouse is barely recognized and is no longer significant to the present community other than as an historical artifact. As noted above, in the mid-1800's this schoolhouse was a small, but significant structure for the small community of people that lived nearby, as was the Jefferson Post Office and residence. In recent years the schoolhouse building has had a series of retail commercial businesses occupying the building.

#### 2.6 Physical condition, security and critical maintenance concerns of property.

The former schoolhouse is not connected to municipal water, sewer or storm sewer. Within the past decades there was a fire in the building that weakened the roof structural system which now sags. [see report in appendix]. There is no basement or crawl space for the building. There is evidence of venting of an air space below the floor with soil under the floor, but vent covers to prevent intrusion by small animals have been removed in some areas. Original brick perimeter walls are generally in sound structural condition, but there is deterioration at some corners, and the rear wall has been covered with stucco. Windows in the building, with wood sash, seem to be original to building. The front entry portion was apparently not part of the original construction and the brick masonry is not tied to the main building. The building is not connected to municipal sewer or water or gas, but these connection points have been provided for during construction of the project north of the subject property.

#### 3.0 EVALUATION OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST

#### 3.1 Heritage Resources within the subject property, landscapes

As a remnant, designated heritage building in the Richmond Hill Inventory, the building clearly has heritage value, but little interest by the community at large currently. The surrounding farm landscape has been redeveloped into new residential with townhouses south of the property facing Yonge Street and mid-scale an 8-story residential apartment building with underground parking immediately to the north of the property.

#### **3.2** History of the property

This original 19<sup>th</sup> century schoolhouse is likely the first structure erected on this remnant lot. The property has been converted to commercial use since it ceased operation as a school, likely in the 20<sup>th</sup> century, and the surrounding farmlands have all been replaced by a variety of contemporary suburban land uses.

#### 3.3 Historical landowners of the property

Chain of property ownership has not been researched, but as noted above, Jonathan Jefferson settled in the agriculture community in mid nineteenth century, establishing a store and post office along Yonge Street prior to the establishment of Richmond Hill as a town/city. At the time this would have been the outskirts of Richmond Hill. Following takeover of aboriginal lands by the British in late 18<sup>th</sup> century and the construction of Yonge Street, this part of Ontario has been in continual settlement/development which is continuing at a rapid pace.

#### 3.4 Cultural Heritage Value or Interest of the subject property

The property was a significant structure when the surrounding area was farmland, and this building as the one-room schoolhouse was significant to the Jefferson community around the schoolhouse, post office and store that existed. Today the area has been totally redeveloped, and this schoolhouse seems to be of little cultural heritage value or interest to the citizens and/or administration of Richmond Hill. Because of its proximity to Yonge Street the Designated Heritage schoolhouse is clearly visible as a small-scaled building of the earlier era here but it seems to be in the path of significant redevelopment of the immediate area.

#### 3.5 Summary evaluation of the property

The Jefferson School building is recognized as a Designated heritage building under the Ontario Heritage Act. The building clearly requires restoration/repair and connection to present day utility systems if it is to remain. Present owner of the building is utilizing the building for commercial use as it is today but finds that extensive development pressure seems to make the property more valuable as a redevelopment site by others. Extensive required restoration/reuse construction repair costs would be prohibitively expensive, which combined with taxes on this now prime Yonge Street frontage property have led the present owner to request demolition and reuse of the existing site. There is minimal provision available from the Town of Richmond Hill for construction repairs, and there is presently no tax abatement program within the municipality which might provide incentive for retention of the Jefferson Schoolhouse as it is.

#### 4.0 DESCRIPTION AND EXAMINATION OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT/SITE ALTERATIONS

#### 4.1 Description of the proposed development, site alteration in relation to heritage resource.

There have been various redevelopment proposals for the property at 11575 Yonge Street [see appendix]. One proposal is to demolish the existing schoolhouse building to create a new highway commercial use. A second proposal is to demolish the existing building and create a new residential apartment, possibly townhouses, possibly multi-storey apartments. These earlier proposals were in keeping with the scale of the newer adjacent redevelopment now completed. Consideration has been given to redevelopment of the property at more intensive use similar in scale to the apartment residential and ground floor commercial uses north of the property.

## 4.2 How the proposed development / site alteration will impact the heritage resources and neighbouring properties.

It is our understanding that there is no firm redevelopment plan or proposal for this property. Preliminary redevelopment / site alteration provided to us as proposed in submitted documents show that redevelopment/site alteration would preclude the existing heritage resource from remaining as a free-standing historical building as it is today. Given the present size of the land with the schoolhouse in the middle of the site, combined with existing newer development on north, south and east sides of the property, redevelopment of this site would not retain the existing Jefferson School house as a freestanding heritage monument. It is possible that a front/west portion of the building could be incorporated into a larger development project. However, the present owner is seeking approval to demolish the existing schoolhouse building to clear the property for redevelopment. Our recommendation is to have any redevelopment of the property explore the potential for incorporating a portion of the heritage schoolhouse into new redevelopment of the property.

At this time the property is privately owned. The remaining portions of the lot to the north and south of the schoolhouse are presently vacant, utilized in part as parking for the commercial business now operating there. Demolition or adaptive reuse of the schoolhouse property would impact the cultural heritage value of the property as follows:

- (a) The design/physical value of the property will be changed, likely never operating as a school again. Should the schoolhouse be demolished, historical evidence of the school would be limited to archival materials, retained artifacts or perhaps an onsite heritage plaque describing former use of the property.
- (b) The historical/associative value will be changed as the existing schoolhouse building is a reminder of this central community facility to the former Jefferson settlement and perhaps to this generation of ancestors that attended the school prior to amalgamation of the property into the Town of Richmond Hill.
- (c) The contextual value of the property has already significantly changed from a small hamlet and farmlands to more intensive suburban and residential uses, leaving only this remaining isolated, historical artifact with minor rather than major impact on surrounding residents or commuters travelling on a much expanded and higher speed Yonge Street, now with transit.

#### 5.0 MITIGATION OPTIONS, CONSERATION METHODS AND PROPOSED ALTERNATIVES

## 5.1 Mitigation measures, conservation methods, and/or alternative development options that avoid or limit the direct and indirect impacts to the heritage resource.

Whether any portion of the existing building can be retained on site remains to be determined. It may be feasible to incorporate the façade or a portion of the schoolhouse into planned redevelopment. Submittal of this CHIA to Town of Richmond Hill Archives will provide a public record of this Registered property. While earlier photographs of the schoolhouse are already part of the archives for the property, present day archival photos of the schoolhouse should be provided if the building is to be removed or relocated. Further, a plaque noting the building in this location, along with its history should be required at a publicly visible location on the property.

This Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment is respectfully submitted by

MW HALL CORPORATION

per: Mark Hall, OAA, MRAIC, FAIA, RPP, CAHP President

#### REFERENCES

- a) Richmond Hill Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and Historical Significance
- b) Town of Richmond Hill Terms of Reference, Heritage Impact Assessment
- c) Ontario Planning Act, Section 2, regarding City Council responsibility for Provincial Interest heritage properties
- d) Ontario Planning Act, Section 3, regarding requirement that Council decisions are consistent with Provincial Policy Statement of 2014.
- e) Ontario Provincial Policy Statement [PPS 2014] section 2.6.3
- f) Ontario Heritage Act Reg. 09/06, Section 2(d) of the Planning Act, Section 2.6 of the Provincial Policy Statement.

#### APPENDICES

- 1- Aerial and Street View Photographs of Vicinity of subject property
- 2- Photographs of existing building on property at 11575 Yonge Street, Richmond Hill, Ontario
- 3- Photographs of adjacent existing buildings.
- 4- Vicinity Map, 11575 Yonge Street, 2019
- 5- 1859 Tremaine Map, excerpt showing property
- 6- Richmond Hill Heritage Register showing 11575 Yonge Street
- 7- Richmond Hill Official Plan map
- 8- Site Plan showing potential commercial redevelopment of property
- 9- Site Plan showing potential residential redevelopment of the property
- 10- Site Plan of potential redevelopment with incorporation of all/part of heritage building
- 11- Concept sketch plan of potential redevelopment
- 12- Building Condition
- 13- Curriculum Vitae, Mark Hall, OAA, MRAIC, FAIA, RPP, CAHP











2d- East elevation of building

1





2g- Northwest corner deterioration

Dh

10

U



2i- Corner deterioration, northeast side

10

-





3b- View looking north from 11575, utility connections available behind concrete wall

.

ner 📰







### 11575 Yonge Street wa

Ward 2

Ward 4

Jefferson Schoolhouse DES Brick; red; 1 storey; 1868; Jefferson Schoolhouse. For more information see designating by-law 149-82

### 11666 Yonge Street

#### William H. Legge House/Jefferson Post Office DES

Brick; red; 2 storeys; c1890; side hall; Romanesque Revival; irregular plan; combined hip and gable roof; stone voussoirs, keystones on round-headed windows; stone lintels on flat-headed openings; circular and round-headed attic windows; leaded glass; William H. Legge. Small 1 storey side wing once served as Jefferson Post Office. For more information see designating by-law 149-03

## 11901 Yonge Street Ward 2

# Summit Valley Golf & Country Club / Fieldstone Cairn

Frame; stucco, wood shingles; 1½ storeys; c1860; L-shaped; hip roof with shed-roofed front dormer; 2 storey square bay window; leaded glass; side bay window; 6/6 windows; frame 1 ½ storey rear wing with centre gable. Renovated c1920; Rocking Horse Ranch. Historical plaque of 1795 establishment of Yonge Street by Simcoe located on property.













TOTAL GROSS FLOOR AREA: 16388.44 SQ.FT.

SITE PLAN

#### 9- Site plan residential

DJECT NO

DWG. No. A1

BATTAGLIA ARCHITECT	INC.
1050 McNicoll Avenue Unit 14 Scarborough, Ontario M1W 2L8 T: 416-492-7772 e-mail: battagila.arch@gmail.com	



<sup>11-</sup> Concept sketch plan of potential development

25 November 2019

NOTE: This report, prepared 2012, accurately depicts condition of the existing schoolhouse building at 11575 Yonge Street, as evidenced in field review conducted 2019, and shown in photographs of the building.

Mark Hall, OAA, MRAIC, FAIA, RPP, CAHP

SKN Developments 11575 Yonge St. Richmond Hill Ontario 905-780-0652 May 3, 2012

Attention Rashid Morati

RE: Century Building Restoration 11575 Yonge St.

**Inspection Report** 

Demolition

There is evidence of a fire with the main damage at the front of the building (west elevation). The char penetrates up to  $\frac{1}{2}$ " deep into the rafters at the front of the building and diminishes toward the rear where the only evidence is light smoke damage, no structural issue. First 8 rafters should be reinforced with a second lam and the balance built down from the collar tie to the exterior wall for proper insulation and ventilation. There is also some deterioration to the roof boards evident at the eaves, this should be dealt with as a site condition and replaced as needed after the ceiling and roofing demolition stage.

Exterior of building shows normal deterioration of wood windows, doors and sills.

Remove the interior drop ceiling and framework to reveal vaulted ceiling constructed of horse hair plaster on wood lath. This is not in good condition and

must be removed to allow for reinforcing of the rafters as well as running new electrical and mechanical.

Soffit and fascia replaced where damaged.

Replace all windows with Fibertech or equal double hung 2 over 2 simulated divided light.

Replace entrance door and install new side door with transom light.

Brick deterioration mainly at grade and around openings, some of the brick has been dyed. Replace as needed with reclaimed brick selected to match as close as possible to existing in colour and size.

Back wall to be reparged or wood siding around new rear entrance.

Complete exterior painting of all wood work windows and doors.

Colour selection from Benjamin Moore HC line to match brick.

Roofing material should be a textured style Cambridge or Royal Estate By IKO, or galvanized steel low profile sheets by Barn Master.

Exterior finish sample package to be presented to Richmond Hill Historical department for approval prior to construction.

If you require further information please contact me at your convenience.

Regards,

**Richard McCord** 

#### ACADEMIC + PROFESSIONAL TRAINING

Harvard University, Master of City Planning in Urban Design US Navy Civil Engineer Corps Officer School, Certificate of Graduation Construction and Design Management Massachusetts Institute of Technology Graduate Studies in Planning and Economics Pratt Institute, Master Degree program studies in Planning and Economics University of Michigan, Bachelor of Architecture **DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION EXPERIENCE** Mariposa Land Development Company [1438224 Ontario Inc.] Toronto / Orillia, President

> Orchard Point Development Company [1657923 Ontario Inc.] Orillia, Vice President MW HALL CORPORATION, Toronto, Toronto, President Teddington Limited, Toronto, Development advisor, Planner, Architect

ARCHIPLAN, Los Angeles, Principal/President

DMJM, Los Angeles, Planner Gruen Associates, Los Angeles, Planner US NAVY, Civil Engineer Corps, Officer Apel, Beckert & Becker, Architects, Frankfurt Green & Savin, Architects, Detroit

#### CITY DEVELOPMENT / URBAN DESIGN / REAL ESTATE DEVELOPMENT

Mark Hall has directed a number of city development and urban design projects, including waterfront revitalization, commercial, multiunit residential, industrial facilities and major mixed use projects in both public and private clients/employers. He has worked on staff for public agencies, including real estate development and property management services. He understands the dynamics of city development, the techniques required for successful implementation, and procedural, financial and political requirements. His experience and contributions range throughout Canada, the United States, Europe, Southeast Asia, the Middle East and the Arctic. As a result of his extensive experience in this area, he has been invited to participate in the Regional Urban Design Assistance Team [R/UDAT] programs of the American Institute of Architects, and a program of waterfront renewal in Toronto by the Ontario Professional Planners Institute. He is a Registered Professional Planner in Ontario, member of the Canadian Institute of Planners, and a founding member of the American Institute of Certified Planners. Recently, as president of Mariposa Land Development Company, he designed and built a 54 unit condominium apartment project designed to upgrade the waterfront of historic downtown Orillia, Ontario. The building has spurred a number of revitalization projects in Orillia.

#### **HISTORIC PRESERVATION / ADAPTIVE REUSE**

Mr. Hall has developed special interest and expertise in historic preservation and adaptive reuse of historic structures and city districts. He has served as president of the Los Angeles Conservancy, and designed projects combining historic preservation and appropriate adaptive reuse of the properties. He is a member of the Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals. Recently he served as preservation architect on renovations of the RC Harris Water Plan, a designated cultural heritage building in Toronto. He has served as architect for restoration and additions to a number of historic houses in the Annex, Beaches and other areas of central city Toronto, as well as Belleville, Orillia, Mississauga and Brampton, and in Los Angeles and Florida. He frequently works with property developers, municipalities and heritage property owners as consultant regarding historic properties of concern to municipalities in which they are working.

#### ARCHITECTURE

A licensed architect for over 40 years, Mr. Hall is licensed to practice in Canada and the US. He has been responsible for design and construction of a number of significant projects: mixed use structures, corporate headquarters and industrial facilities, military facilities, multi-unit residential, civic and commercial centres, and seniors housing. He understands the design, construction and real estate development process, as well as management of multi-disciplinary and client concerns for cost effective, efficient, award-winning structures. Many of the structures he has built are the result of implementing more comprehensive master planned developments. For his work in historic preservation, education and community service he was awarded Fellowship in the American Institute of Architects.

#### **COMMUNITY & EDUCATION SERVICE**

In addition to professional practice, Mr. Hall has made major commitments to teaching and community service. He taught urban design and city planning at USC, UCLA, Southern California Institute of Architecture [SCI ARC] and Boston Architectural Center. While at Harvard he worked with the Harvard Urban Field Service in Boston's Chinatown. As an officer in the US NAVY he was awarded a special Commendation Medal for development of a master plan for the NAVY's Arctic Research Laboratory and the adjacent Inupiat community of Barrow, Alaska. His work has been published in professional journals and has received various awards and honors. He served on the board of directors and later as president of the Southern California chapter of the American Institute of Architects. He was co-chair for the Ontario Professional Planners Institute [OPPI] of a multi-disciplinary design Charette to determine the future of the Metropolitan Toronto waterfront, and later on a committee of the Ontario Association of Architects looking into solutions to urban sprawl. He has served as president of the non-profit Housing Development Resource Centre [HRDC] and as president of Toronto Brigantine, a non-profit organization providing sail training aboard two tall ships in the Great Lakes.