



Staff Report for Heritage Richmond Hill Meeting

Date of Meeting: May 4, 2021

Report Number: SRPI.21.046

Department: Planning and Infrastructure

Division: Policy Planning

Subject: **SRPI.21.046 Heritage Permit Application for 16 Bawden Drive; Hilts/Bawden House – File D12-07267**

Purpose:

To seek Heritage Richmond Hill's recommendation to Council to approve the Heritage Permit Application to modify the approved Conservation Plan for 16 Bawden Drive by making changes to the east elevation, including replacing the circa 1940s vestibule with a bellcast verandah, and to construct a new two-storey addition and a detached garage.

Recommendation(s):

- a) That the Heritage Permit Application to amend the approved Conservation Plan for 16 Bawden Drive, as described in Appendix C to this report, be approved.

Contact Person:

Pamela Vega, Heritage & Urban Design Planner, phone number 905-771-5529

Joanne Leung, Manager of Urban Design and Heritage, phone number 905-771-5498

Report Approval:

Submitted by: Kelvin Kwan, Commissioner of Planning and Infrastructure Department

Approved by: Mary-Anne Dempster, City Manager

All reports are electronically reviewed and/or approved by the Division Director, Treasurer (as required), City Solicitor (as required), Commissioner, and City Manager. Details of the reports approval are attached.

Location Map:

The map below illustrates the subject property location. Should you require an alternative format, call the contact person listed in this document.

Page 2

MAP 1 - AERIAL PHOTOGRAPH



Background:

The property containing the Hilts/Bawden House, located at 16 Bawden Drive, is designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* under Designating By-law 19-08, amended by By-law 53-17, for design, associative and contextual reasons. These reasons are outlined in the By-laws, attached as Appendix B to this report.

In 2017, as part of a proposed Plan of Subdivision development, Council approved a Conservation Plan for the rehabilitation of the Hilts/Bawden House. Prepared by Scott Rushlow Associates Ltd and reviewed by the heritage consultant Wayne Morgan, this Conservation Plan applied only to the original portion of the building identified in the designating by-law and not the circa 1960s northern two-storey addition. The Conservation Plan proposed the repair, rather than the replacement, of the heritage fabric associated with the heritage attributes of the house. Where the fabric cannot be repaired, the Plan provided for the replacement of the fabric using similar materials that replicate the appearance of the heritage attribute. This Conservation Plan is attached as Appendix C to this report.

Page 3

While removing the interior elements in preparation of undertaking the work outlined in the Conservation Plan, it was discovered that the alterations made to the building in the 1940s have compromised the structural integrity of the historic building, and that the one-storey vestibule on the east elevation has become deteriorated.

Heritage Permit Proposal

The work proposed in the Heritage Permit Application falls into two categories: modifications to the already approved Conservation Plan; and the construction of new buildings. This work is described in more detail below.

Modifications to the Conservation Plan

The Conservation Plan approved in 2017 proposed to restore the east elevation as-is. Alterations made in the 1940s, including the addition of the three dormers, the creation of a large southern first storey window, and an enclosed one-storey vestibule, were to be repaired and retained.

The owner is proposing to modify the central dormer by giving it a gable roof and converting the door into a Palladian window. The owner also proposes to remove the non-original enclosed vestibule and constructing a bellcast verandah in its place. The large southerly first-storey window is to be replaced with a 6/6 window that matches the original first storey window on the northernmost bay.

New Construction

The owner is proposing a two-storey board and batten gable-roofed addition to the north of the Hilts/Bawden House, connected to the historic house through a glass walkway. It is proposed to be constructed perpendicular to the house. A new 1.5 storey detached garage with studio is proposed to be constructed south of the existing house. With a board and batten exterior and a metal roof, it will match the colour and style of the proposed new addition.

Discussion:

Modifications to the Conservation Plan

Changing the roofline of the central dormer on the east elevation will tie it in to the two other gable-roofed dormers on the east side and will help to create a more cohesive façade. Converting the second storey door into a Palladian window, and extending the protruding central bay on the ground floor provides greater emphasis to this entrance, which is more fitting of a main entryway.

The proposed new bellcast verandah across the east elevation, though more ornamental than what the original porch may have been, complements the subdued Georgian vernacular style of the Hilts/Bawden House, and creates an inviting, prominent front entrance.

Page 4

The exterior wooden elements are proposed to be repainted in new colours — “Monterey White” for the windows, window surrounds, verandah and porch, black for the shutters, “Newburg Green” for the doors, and “Coventry Gray” for the siding in the central dormer on the east elevation. All of these colours are from the Benjamin Moore Historical Collection, and are complementary to the warm tones of the stone masonry of the Hilts/Bawden House.

The modifications proposed for the Conservation Plan will remove elements of the original Hilts/Bawden House that were distracting from the building’s architecture, and will introduce architectural elements that are more complementary to the property’s historic attributes and is more in keeping with its architectural style. Staff is in support of the modifications proposed to the Conservation Plan.

New Construction

The two-storey wing that was added to the Hilts/Bawden House in the 1960s reflects a conservation approach that was popular in the mid- to late-20th century. Almost completely replicating the east façade, this historic-looking addition was considered to be complementary to the historical house.

In the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* (the “Standards”), Standard 11 states, “(a) Conserve the heritage value and character-defining elements when creating any new additions to an historic place or any related new construction. (b) Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, and distinguishable from the historic place.”

The new proposed two-storey addition meets the Standards. Its side gable roof reflects the original roofline of the Hilts/Bawden House, and its board and batten wood siding makes it distinguishable from the original house. The use of dark colours and a metal roof acts to further distinguish it from the original building, and also identifies it as a modern construction while not detracting from the historic house. Placing it perpendicularly to the house, so that the narrowest façade of the addition faces the street, also minimizes the visual impact on the historic house (see Figure 1).

Page 5



Figure 1: Drawing of east façade illustrating restoration works on the existing house on the left and the proposed new addition on the right.

The location of the new garage to the south of the Hilts/Bawden House minimizes its visual impact on the property’s heritage attributes. The swift change in elevation from the proposed location to the street, the large mature trees in this area of the property, and the garage’s dark exterior colours, help to ensure that the new building does not distract from the property’s heritage building (see Figure 2). Staff is in support of the construction of the addition to the house and the construction of a new detached garage and studio building.



Figure 2: Site plan showing the location of the proposed new garage to the south of the existing house.

Financial/Staffing/Other Implications:

There are no financial or staffing implications at this time.

Relationship to the Strategic Plan:

A detailed consideration of the heritage merits of the subject property is in keeping with **Goal 3 “Respect the past through promoting the awareness of the City’s heritage”**. It further implements the direction to achieve **Goal 3, “A More Vibrant Richmond Hill”** specifically by “stewarding Richmond Hill’s heritage resources.”

Page 7

Conclusion:

The proposed alterations to the house at 16 Bawden Drive allows for the continued conservation of its historic stone farmhouse. The new construction will result in minimal visual impact to the structure, and the modifications to the Conservation Plan will complement and enhance the farmhouse's heritage attributes.

The owner of the property has worked with the City and created a proposal that allows for the continued existence of the identified heritage resources. Having reviewed the submitted elevation drawings, staff recommends that the Heritage Permit Application be approved.

Attachments:

The following attached documents may include scanned images of appendixes, maps and photographs. All attachments have been reviewed and made accessible. If you require an alternative format please call the contact person listed in this document.

- Appendix A – Drawings prepared by Scott Rushlow Associates Ltd.
- Appendix B – Designation By-law 19-08 and Amending By-law 53-17
- Appendix C – Conservation Plan for the Hilts/Bawden House, Richmond Hill, prepared by Scott Rushlow Associates Ltd., with comments from Wayne Morgan (January 2017)

Page 8

Report Approval Details

Document Title:	SRPI.21.046 Heritage Permit Application for 16 Bawden Drive.docx
Attachments:	- SRPI.21.046 Appendix A.pdf - SRPI. 21.046 Appendix B.pdf - SRPI.21.046 Appendix C.pdf
Final Approval Date:	Apr 16, 2021

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:

Patrick Lee - Apr 16, 2021 - 12:00 PM

Kelvin Kwan - Apr 16, 2021 - 1:23 PM

MaryAnne Dempster - Apr 16, 2021 - 2:52 PM