

Staff Report for Heritage Richmond Hill Meeting

Date of Meeting: November 9, 2021 Report Number: SRPI.21.103

Department:	Planning and Infrastructure
Division:	Policy Planning

Subject: SRPI.21.103 – Heritage Permit Application for 53 Arnold Crescent (The McNair-Stallibrass House) – File D12-07010

Purpose:

To seek Heritage Richmond Hill's recommendation to Council to approve the Heritage Permit Application to replace the rear door of the designated structure at 53 Arnold Crescent.

Recommendation(s):

a) That the Heritage Permit Application to replace the rear door, as described in report SRPI.21.103, be approved.

Contact Person:

Pamela Vega, Heritage & Urban Design Planner, phone number 905-771-5529 Joanne Leung, Manager of Urban Design and Heritage, phone number 905-771-5498

Report Approval:

Submitted by: Kelvin Kwan, Commissioner of Planning and Infrastructure

Approved by: Mary-Anne Dempster, City Manager

All reports are electronically reviewed and/or approved by the Division Director, Treasurer (as required), City Solicitor (as required), Commissioner, and City Manager. Details of the reports approval are attached.

Location Map:

The map below depicts the location of the subject property. Should you require an alternative format, call the contact person listed in this document.



Background:

The property located at 53 Arnold Crescent (the "Subject Property") contains the McNair-Stallibrass House, which was built circa 1879 and is designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* through Designating By-law 133-95 for historical and design reasons.

The owner of the Subject Property is proposing to alter the existing rear doorway by removing the existing door and sidelights and installing new French doors with sidelights (see Appendix A and Figures 1 and 2). This will require the owner to remove approximately 4 feet of wall to the right of the existing door (see Figure 1). The owner proposes to paint the new doors Heritage Red (HC-181), which is from Benjamin Moore's Historical Collections colour palette.

City of Richmond Hill – Heritage Richmond Hill Meeting Date of Meeting: November 9, 2021 Report Number: SRPI.21.103





Figure 1: Floorplan showing the existing rear door circled in green on the left, and a floorplan showing the proposed new rear door circled in green on the right.



Figure 2: Drawing of proposed new rear door with sidelights.

City of Richmond Hill – Heritage Richmond Hill Meeting Date of Meeting: November 9, 2021 Report Number: SRPI.21.103

Page 4

While the owner provides that this alteration will be converting the door to its original configuration, and that the differences in the exterior cladding material around the existing door indicate the door's original configuration (see Figure 3), aerial photographs from 1970 indicate that there was a small one-storey addition to the rear of the McNair-Stallibrass House in the area where the current rear door exists (see Figure 4). As the different cladding materials match the general dimensions of this earlier structure, staff believe that the changes to the cladding around the door are due to the removal of the rear addition rather than an earlier doorway.



Figure 3: Photo of the McNair-Stallibrass House's rear façade. Note the change in siding around the door, as well as a beam-like element above the door.

City of Richmond Hill – Heritage Richmond Hill Meeting Date of Meeting: November 9, 2021 Report Number: SRPI.21.103 Page 5



Figure 4: Aerial photograph from 1970 showing the existence of a small one-storey addition in the location of where the current rear door exists. The yellow arrow is pointing to this addition.

Regardless, the existing rear door and the area around the door have previously been altered and are not original to the building.

Discussion:

The following section describes the impact that the alteration to the rear door will have on the Subject Property's heritage attributes.

Physical Impact

The rear door is not original and is not identified as a heritage attribute. The portion of wall being proposed for removal to allow for a wider door has previously been altered. Accordingly, there are no physical impacts to the heritage attributes of the McNair-Stallibrass House.

Visual Impact

The existing door is not original to the house and its asymmetrical design detracts from the design of the rear façade; a symmetrical door will be more complementary to the building's design. The door's location at the rear of the house also means that it will not be visible from the public realm. Accordingly, the proposed alteration to the rear door will have a limited visual impact on the property's heritage attributes.

Financial/Staffing/Other Implications:

There are no financial or staffing implications at this time.

Relationship to the Strategic Plan:

A detailed consideration of the heritage merits of the Subject Property is in keeping with **Goal 3 "Respect the past through promoting the awareness of the City's heritage".** It further implements the direction to achieve **Goal 3, "A More Vibrant Richmond Hill"** specifically by "stewarding Richmond Hill's heritage resources."

Conclusion:

The area of the McNair-Stallibrass House that is being proposed to be altered does not contain original architectural elements and the alteration will not physically impact the property's heritage attributes. The visual impact to the street will also be minimized due to its location at the rear of the building. Accordingly, the proposed alteration to the rear door can be supported from a cultural heritage perspective.

Attachments:

The following attached documents may include scanned images of appendixes, maps and photographs. All attachments have been reviewed and made accessible. If you require an alternative format please call the contact person listed in this document.

• Appendix A – Heritage Permit Application for 53 Arnold Crescent

Report Approval Details

Document Title:	SRPI.21.103 - Heritage Permit Application for 53 Arnold Crescent (The McNair-Stallibrass House) - File D12- 07010.docx
Attachments:	- Appendix A to SRPI.21.103.pdf
Final Approval Date:	Oct 20, 2021

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:

Patrick Lee - Oct 19, 2021 - 3:27 PM

Kelvin Kwan - Oct 19, 2021 - 3:37 PM

MaryAnne Dempster - Oct 20, 2021 - 2:58 PM