

**RICHMOND HILL PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH CEMETERY
ADDENDUM TO THE CONSERVATION PLAN FOR THE OCTAGONAL VAULT (WINTER CRYPT)
March 23, 2023**

The Conservation Plan for the Winter Crypt in the Richmond Hill Presbyterian Church Cemetery, dated January 29, 2023, was submitted to Heritage & Urban Design, City of Richmond Hill, in support of an application for a heritage permit for proposed repairs to the building.

This addendum is submitted to update the proposed replacement roof finish from wood shingles to asphalt shingles, replacing the description in Paragraph 5.2 in Section 5, Recommended Repairs, of the Conservation Plan.

Conservation Intent

The intent of the trustees of the Richmond Hill Presbyterian Church Cemetery to restore the fabric of the heritage designated Crypt in accordance with the standards and guidelines set out by the Ontario Ministry of Culture (8 Guiding Principles in the Conservation of Built Heritage Properties) has not altered for the overall project.

Replacement costs

After the Conservation Plan was submitted, further financial analysis was undertaken because of concern about the high estimated cost for a cedar shingle roof.

Competitive bids were obtained for both wood and asphalt shingle replacement roofs finishes from contractors with a proven reputation in the construction industry and based on detailed drawings and specifications prepared by Edwin Rowse, Heritage Architect. The bid documents and contractors' bids are enclosed with this addendum.

Please note that these bids are active, represent proprietary information and should remain private and not be divulged to any third party.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] he Trustees of the cemetery have determined that the one-time replacement cost for this one item of work, which represents a large proportion of the overall project budget, far exceeds the capacity of the cemetery's operating budget to absorb, annually and cumulatively, even when supplemented by possible municipal funding, making the conservation plan costs as currently understood not financially viable.

With the cost of an asphalt shingle roof, the overall conservation plan cost becomes viable and the remainder of the proposed work can be divided up into small packages and spread out in a multi-year plan, following on from the roof replacement.

The roof replacement is the highest priority work item because of its severely deteriorated condition. It has to be executed in one phase because of the integrated nature of its construction and urgently to halt the severe leakage which is causing knock-on deterioration of the walls and roof framing below.

Conservation Approach Analysis

The proposal to replace the roof finish in asphalt shingles does not follow the principle of replacing like with like, adopted for the project in general, with the consequent loss of the heritage value, appearance and authenticity of this one element of the building fabric. However, this loss has to be measured in terms of the present risks to the overall heritage value of the building.

National and provincial heritage conservation standards and guidelines do not contemplate the implications of unsustainable costs on a project. However, it can be reasonably inferred that the overall protection of the fabric, and its associated cultural value, of a building is the highest objective. Further the load-bearing structural elements, the walls and roof structure, are fundamental to a building's long-term survival whereas the roof finish, by its protective nature and shorter life span, is in some sense sacrificial. It may be replaced many times in the life of a masonry building, in particular, and a modest asphalt shingle replacement installed now protects the building fabric to allow a future possibility of a wood shingle roof.

The other conservation issue is the shear urgency of stopping the rainwater leakage by this summer to avoid the knock-on deterioration, especially of the wood boarded roof deck or sheathing.

Revised Conservation Plan

Thus, the revised wording for Paragraph 5.2 of the Plan would read as follows:

Roof finish

- 5.2.1 Remove the existing decayed shingle roof down to the wood roof deck and make good any damaged or decayed deck boards.
- 5.2.2 Install new galvanized sheet metal drip edge flashing and a peel-and-stick waterproof membrane 3 feet (900 mm) up from eaves, bonded to the drip edge.
- 5.2.3 Install a synthetic breathable underlayment over all remaining exposed areas of wood deck and turned up under the roof ventilator.
- 5.2.4 Install strip, interlocking architectural type asphalt shingles, with 30 – 35 year warranty and weather blocker eave and hip shingles to the same specification.
- 5.2.5 Asphalt shingle colour to match “Weathered Wood” by IKO.
- 5.2.6 Install galvanized sheet metal apron flashing around ventilator base with single-lock sweated seams to connect apron panels.
- 5.2.7 The simple wood eaves soffit and fascia is in serviceable condition and may need some refastening, surface preparation and repainting. The recommended drip edge flashing will provide additional protection for the fascia.

END OF ADDENDUM



Edwin Rowse Architecture Inc.
26 Wayland Avenue, Toronto
Ontario M4E 3C7
C 416-579-9947
Edwin@rowsearchitecture.ca